Case: 1:09-cv-01589 Document #: 100-2 Filed: 11/03/10 Page 1 of 28 PageID #:1424

EXHIBIT B

April 27, 2010

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 1. NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS 2 sworn.) EASTERN DIVISION 3 AMERICAN AUTOMOBILE 4 INSURANCE COMPANY, a 5 Missouri corporation, 6 Plaintiff, 7 BY MR. RICE:) Case No. 8 B.D. McCLURE AND 9 correctly? ASSOCIATES, LTD., et al., 10 A. Ciarrachi. Defendants. 11 12 full name for the record? The deposition of DAVID A. CIARRACHI, called for examination, taken pursuant to the Federal 13 Rules of Civil Procedure of the United States 14 C-I-A-R-R-A-C-H-I. 15 District Courts pertaining to the taking of depositions, taken before ALICE M. SCHWINGER, CSR 16 NO. 84-2913, a Notary Public within and for the County of DuPage, State of Illinois, and a

2

23

24

(WHEREUPON, the witness was duly DAVID A. CIARRACHI, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows: DIRECT EXAMINATION Q. Mr. Ciarrachi, am I pronouncing that Q. Could you please state and spell your A. David Anthony Ciarrachi, MR. RICE: Let the record reflect that this is the deposition of David Ciarrachi taken in the case of American Automobile Insurance Company B.D. McClure and Associates, Case No. 09 CV 19 which is currently pending in the United States District Court for the Northern District of 20 21 Illinois. 22 This deposition is being taken pursuant to subpoena and notice and in accordance with the

Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the United States

PRESENT: 1 HINSHAW & CULBERTSON, LLP, 2 (222 North LaSalle Street, Suite 300, 3 Chicago, Illinois 60601, 4 5 (312) 704-3000), by: 6 MR. DANA A. RICE, appeared on behalf of the Plaintiff; 7 8 CONNELLY, ROBERTS & McGIVNEY, LLC, 9 (55 West Monroe Street, Suite 1700, Chicago, Illinois 60603, 10 312/251-9600), by: 11 MR. JEFFREY J. SCOLARO, 12 appeared on behalf of B.D. McClure and 13 14 Associates; 15 KAVANAGH, GRUMLEY & GORBOLD, LLC, (111 North Ottawa Street, 16 17 Joliet, Illinois 60434, 18 815/727-1586), by: MR. PAUL RICHARDS, 19 20 appeared on behalf of Dale J. Sippel 21 d/b/a Genie Temporary Services; 22 23 REPORTED BY: ALICE M. SCHWINGER, CSR

Certified Shorthand Reporter of said state, at 2067

Burlington Avenue, Lisle, Illinois, on the 27th day

of April, A.D. 2010, commencing at 9:30 a.m.

District Courts. 1 BY MR. RICE: 2 Q. Mr. Ciarrachi, my name is Dana Rice. I 3 represent American Automobile Insurance Company in 4 5 a lawsuit involving B.D. McClure and Associates and Genie Temporary Services; okay? A. Mm-hmm. 8 Q. I'm going to be asking you a series of questions today. Have you ever given a deposition 9 before? 10 A. Yes. 11 12 Q. So you're very familiar with the process. If at any time today you don't understand 13 my question or it's too convoluted, which often 15 happens when I ask questions, just let me know, I'd 16 be happy to reask it, rephrase it. If you answer a 17 question that I ask, I'll assume you understood 1.8 what I was asking and that was your answer; is that fair? 19 20 A. Yes. 21 Q. I know that sometimes during the course of the conversation, you know -- you may know

exactly what I'm asking for and you know what your

answer is going to be. Just let me finish my



24

CSR No. 84-2913.

Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

1

3

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

6

answer the question.

BY THE WITNESS:

A. 8/23/43.

'43.

Q. '43? I'm sorry.

BY MR. RICE:

general ---

A.

A. No, I understand.

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

question before you answer, it's just for the 2 benefit of the court reporter --3

A. Sure.

Q. -- so down the road when we try to read

5 this two months from now, it reads well.

A. Yes.

7 Q. And then make sure that all of your

answers to my questions are verbal, yes, no or an 9 answer, rather than uh-huh or uh-uh, those are

10 difficult for the court reporter to take down;

11 okay?

6

12

13

A. Yes.

Q. And then if at any time you need to take a break, use the restroom, I'm more than happy to do that, just let me know; okay?

16 A. Okav.

17 Q. At the outset, are you aware of any

18 conditions you have or any medications that you

19 taking that would affect in any way your ability to 20

give truthful and complete answers to my questions

21 today?

1

6

10

20

A. No. 22

Q. Did you review any documents in 23

preparation for your deposition today? 24

24

Illinois. 1 Q. And do you have any plans on moving from

Where do you currently live?

1012 South Cherry Lane, Lombard,

MR. SCOLARO: I object on the basis of

attorney-client privilege to the extent that there

was anything referred to in our -- in Brian and

Maybe you can repeat that.

relate to things that you either got from

the substance of his deposition.

Dave's conversation, but to the extent that there

wasn't anything that was discussed, it may or may not be attorney-client privilege and Dave may

Q. Did you speak to Brian McClure about the

substance of his deposition which in any way didn't

Mr. Scolaro in that letter or that, you know, was a

A. No, it was a general conversation about

Q. Mr. Ciarrachi, when were you born?

3 that address any time soon?

A. No. 4

5 Q. If you could just briefly describe to me

your educational background.

A. College, Elmhurst College, 1968. 7

8 Q. What degree did you obtain at Elmhurst?

A. Marketing and psychology. 9

Q. Any post-graduate work? 10

A. No. 11

Q. Where are you currently employed? 12

A. I'm a partner in McClure and Associates 13

14 and Brimar Administration at -- what's the address 15 here -- 2067 Burlington Avenue, Lisle, Illinois.

Q. And the name, full name of Brimar is 16

17 what?

A. Brimar Administration. 18

Q. Is that a company? 19

A. Yes, it's an LLC. 20

Q. Do you know when it was formed? 21

22 A. Exact date, no, but sometime in the

early '80s. 23

24

Q. Are you a partner in the LLC?

2 Q. What documents did you review?

3 A. An overall letter that Jeff Scolaro had

provided for me about the substance of a deposition

that my partner, Brian McClure, had given me. 5

MR. RICE: And Jeff, just so I'm clear, are

7 you representing Mr. Ciarrachi in this -- as it

pertains to this case?

MR. SCOLARO: We are. 9

MR. RICE: And so I will assume you're going

to assert attorney-client privilege over the 11

12

MR. SCOLARO: I am. 13

14 BY MR RICE:

Q. Aside from Jeff Scolaro, did you speak 15

with anyone else about your deposition today? 16

17 A. No.

Q. You didn't talk to Mr. McClure about it? 18

A. About this deposition or his deposition? 19

Q. Your deposition today.

21 A. No.

22 Q. Did you talk about his deposition?

23

Q. What did you talk about?

Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

5

9

12

16

20

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

11

1.2

Yes. 1 A.

2 Are you the sole partner? Q.

A. No.

3

6

7

11

14

19

20

2

4

8

12

13

Who else is a partner in Brimar 4

Administration, LLC? 5

Brian McClure.

Q. Anyone else?

8 Α. No.

What's your position within Brimar? g Q.

10 A. President.

> Q. And how long have you been the president

for? 12

Since the date of its LLC incorporation. 13

Q. Has Brimar been in business since its

incorporation? 1.5

A. Before then. 16

Q. And prior to that, did it -- was it 1.7

18 working or operating under any different name?

Q. You just hadn't formally incorporated --

21 A. It was a sole proprietorship prior to

the LLC formation. 22

Q. Do you know when Brimar started doing 23

24 business?

A. 1976. 1

Q. If you could, just briefly describe to

me what Brimar does. 3

A. We're an administration company for

McClure and Associates in that we have several

clients who we unbundle coverages for in the

7 that we act as their claims administrator for the

portion of the policy that they have taken upon

themselves through a deductible format. 9

Q. Would that apply to both deductibles 10

11 and, for example, SIRs?

A. Yes.

Just so I understand, so if a client of

McClure and Associates purchased several 14

types of insurance, commercial, auto, CGL, 15

whatever, to the extent they decided to have a 16

deductible on any facet of that coverage or an

18 in the facet of that coverage, you would serve as

19 the claims administrator for that particular

portion of coverage?

A. If they chose to do that and the carrier

22 allowed us to do that.

23 Q. Is that carrier specific?

I'm not -- I don't quite follow that. 24

Q. Is the ability for Brimar to act as an 1

administrator for the insured carrier specific,

3 meaning do certain carriers allow you to do that

and certain ones don't? 4

A. It's on a negotiated basis.

6 And would you negotiate that both with

7 the carrier and the insured?

8 A. Yes.

Q. Are you a licensed insurance broker?

10 Α

11 Q. Have you ever been?

A. No.

13 Q. Do you hold any other insurance-related

14 licenses?

15

Q. Do you need to to be an administrator?

17 A.

18 Did you take any additional educational

19 courses or anything like that post your graduate

degree in Elmhurst to operate Brimar?

21 A. I was a formal -- I was a former

employee of the insurance industry as a bodily 22

23 injury adjuster and a commercial claims manager,

and during that period of time, I took numerous

10

classes at the insurance institute adjusting CPCU, 1

various associated courses to my occupation with 2

the insurance industry.

Q. So this would have been sometime before

5 the early '70s or mid '70s?

A. Late '60s and '70s, yes.

7 What carrier were you working for back

then? 8

9 A. When I was the claims manager or

adjuster? 10

16

21

23

Q. Do the adjuster first. 11

12 Home Indemnity of New York.

Where was that based out of? 13

10 South Riverside Plaza in Chicago. 14

15 Q. And you were a claims administrator for

them?

17 A. No, I was a claims adjuster. I then

18 became a claims manager for Nationwide Insurance

19 Company who are based in Columbus, Ohio.

Q. When did you start with Home Indemnity? 20

A.

22 Q. And then when did you join Nationwide?

Α. 1972

Q. 2.4 After you left Nationwide, is that when



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

2

3

8

13

16

19

22

14

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

16

you started up Brimar?

A. Brimar was ongoing while I was with Nationwide on a part-time basis, and then when

Brian McClure and myself became partners in

the agency and the administration company, we 5 formulated the outline of the program I had given 6 7 you earlier.

So is it fair to say that while you were 8 working at Nationwide, you were also adjusting claims through Brimar?

Yes. A.

11

1.4

15

16

17

18

19

1

2

3

4

6

7

13

14

15

16

18

19

20

24

Did Brimar have an administration 12 Q. agreement with Nationwide or --13

A. No.

-- was it just --

A.

Did you administer any Nationwide Q. policies?

A. No.

Let me take that back. When you say 20 administer Nationwide policies, we wrote an 21 with Nationwide while I was with McClure that

us administration ability. In other words,

Nationwide gave us the ability to administer the

program as I described earlier, so at that point in that program, we were the administrator for that account.

Q. Okay. How many employees does Brimar currently have? A. I'm not certain how they -- how our

accountant breaks down the differential of employees between Brimar and McClure because 8 jointly owned 50 percent and I'm not sure how the accounting process works as to which employee is a 10 Brimar employee, which employee is a McClure 11 12 employee.

Q. I understand that Brimar operates out of the office we're currently at?

A. That's right.

Q. I also understand that McClure and

Associates also operates out of this office? 17

A. That's right.

Q. It's my understanding in speaking with Mr. McClure at his deposition that both Brimar and

McClure and Associates share staff; is that fair? 21

MR. SCOLARO: Could you define staff? 22

BY MR. RICE: 23

Q. First of all, how many people answer the

phones for Brimar? 1

> A. It's a joint venture, so I would say that's a shared staff.

4 Q. So how many -- do you have any -- how 5 many people do you believe to be shared staff between Brimar and McClure and Associates?

A. I would say probably everybody here is, some to a much greater degree than others.

Q. So during the course of the day, one 9 10 member of McClure and Associates staff may have more duties with respect to McClure and 11

than does Brimar, but there could be some 12

A. That's right.

Is there anybody that works at this 14 office that works exclusively for Brimar? 15

A. No.

Q. Is there anybody at this office that 17 works exclusively for Mr. McClure? 18

Α.

Is there anyone outside of this office 2.0 21

that works for Brimar?

A. No.

Q. So every staff member and/or employee 23 that is paid by Brimar would be located at this 24

office? 1.

2

3

23

A. The payment of employees is a joint venture, there would be no employee paid specifically by Brimar.

Q. Would the payment then come from McClure and Associates or the combination of McClure and Ciarrachi?

MR. SCOLARO: Objection: Asked and answered, 9 but go ahead.

BY THE WITNESS: 10

A. It would be -- again, it's an accounting 11 procedure. I'm not certain how the accountant has 12 13 the spread of distribution to salary.

BY MR. RICE: 14

15 Q. I saw -- you know, we've exchanged a lot 16 of documents in this case and I saw Brimar's name listed a number of different ways, so I just want 17 to ask you if it may be a mistake they were written 18

this way or these may have been prior companies, I 19

just want to make sure. 20

21 Is there any such entity as Brimar Investigations, Inc.? 22

A. That was the sole proprietorship.

Q. So that's what --24



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

4

5

8

9

18

19

20

22

24

2

7

8

18

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

2.0

Same company.

That was what Brimar started at prior to 2 Q.

3 its formation as an LLC?

A. That's right. 4

5

7

8

10

16

17

18

1

3

4

8

10

12

14

Q. So is it fair to say then that was

formed sometime in the early '70s? 6

A. Early '80s.

Q. The Brimar Investigations?

9 A. No, the Brimar Administration.

Q. When was Brimar Investigations started?

A. In the mid '70s, I think it's '76, '77, 11

something like that. 12

Q. And again, Brimar Investigations 13 provided essentially the same services as Brimar 14

Administration, it was just a different name? 15

A. No, no. Basically what that -- I was the sole proprietor with Brimar Investigations and I did investigational work, sometimes pre-trial,

sometimes for an insurance company on a fee 19

So I worked for many companies. 2.0

There was no coverage involved or no 21 22 separation of coverage and claims administration

when I was working as a sole proprietor, strictly

an investigational phase of my business operation.

1 Q. Has there ever been any other Brimar names that you're aware or that you've been 3 associated with?

A. No.

Q. What is Brimar's relationship with B.D.

McClure and Associates?

A. I answered that question earlier.

Could you answer it again?

A. Well, we -- in certain policies, we will

present to a given prospective client an option of 10 11 administration of claims that they may not want done by the carrier and they want unbundled

done by us as an administrator. 13

Q. How long have you been administering 14 15 claims for McClure and Associates?

A. Since 198 -- whatever the year is I told 16 you we were made an LLC. 17

Q. How long have you known Brian

Since about 1980.

Did you know him prior to becoming a

21 partner with him?

> Α. Yes.

23 Q. On a personal level then?

Α.

Q. So a carrier may hire you to help assist 2 in preparing a matter for trial, for example?

A. That's right.

There was no adjustment of claims

process at that point? 5

A. Or a law firm may hire me. As a matter 6

7 of fact, your law firm hired me.

> Oh, really? Q.

9 Yes. Α.

> Q. When did we hire you, do you recall?

11 Α. Late '60s.

Q. Probably before I was born; right?

A. A long, long time ago. 13

Q. Who did you work with?

A. I couldn't tell you their names. 15

Q. Do you remember what the case was? 16

A. No. Numerous cases. 17

Q. I also saw the name Brimar Industries? 18

19 A. Never heard of it.

20 Q. Aside from Brimar Investigations, which

was the sole proprietorship, and then Brimar 21

Administration, have you operated under any other 22

name? 23

24 A. No.

Q. So solely business partners? 1

A. He was with Nationwide Insurance Company

as a salesman, I was there as a claims manager.

Q. And at some point while you were at

Nationwide, you decided to branch off and do your

own thing? 6

We thought we could make a better wheel.

Mr. McClure mentioned during his

deposition that in addition to B.D. McClure and 9

Associates and Brimar Administration, there was 10

this third entity created called McClure and 11

Ciarrachi, LLC? 12

13 A. It's a funnel account for the funds of

both corporations. 14

Q. I didn't catch the -- funnel account for 15

both? 16

21

23

A. Corporations, with LLCs, funnel all of 17

their -- the revenues into one which is the, 18

19 whatever you called it, the --

Q. McClure and Ciarrachi Associates? 20

A. Yeah.

Just so I'm clear for the record --22

A. There are no employees in that grouping,

that's strictly an accounting name for the 24



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2

3

4

10

11

1.2

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

23

24

Α.

Q.

Α.

A. Yes.

but go ahead.

A. Yes.

BY MR. RICE:

A. Yes.

familiar with that?

50/50?

McClure and Associates?

50 percent of Brimar; correct?

Yes.

BY THE WITNESS:

of it

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

23

24

funneling of -- in how we handle our finances. 2 MR. SCOLARO: I want to take a quick break 3 after he's done answering this question. 4 BY MR. RICE: 5

Q. And I just want to make sure for the record because I know exactly what you're saying, I

7 just want the record to be clear, the McClure and

8 Ciarrachi Associates is a funnel account where

money is funneled from B.D. McClure and Associates 9

10 and Brimar Administration; is that correct?

MR. SCOLARO: Objection to the extent that my 11 client is not an accountant, but to the extent he 12

13 understands the question.

BY THE WITNESS: 14

A. I understand what you're saying, but 15 16 again, you know, the accounting procedures, I'm not involved day-to-day in the accounting procedures, 17

so I couldn't tell you exactly with absolute 18

certainty how that works, and rather than tell you 19

something that I'm guessing at, I would rather not 20

answer that question specifically. 21

22 MR. RICE: If you want to take a break, I have more questions about this organization but --23

MR. SCOLARO: It will be two minutes.

1 A. Yes.

> Q. Do you know when McClure started soliciting or selling AEG insurance?

A. I'd be guessing, but '05 or '06.

Where is he located?

Is he with a company?

interest in the McClure and Ciarrachi LLC?

He is, but I couldn't tell you the name

Do you and Mr. McClure own equal

Q. And do you own a 50 percent interest in

Q. And then McClure -- Mr. McClure owns

Q. The subject matter of this lawsuit

insurance that was sold involving AEG. Are you

involves a lot of claims that are related to

MR. SCOLARO: Objection: Asked and

Northbrook, Illinois.

Q. Do you know approximately how long 5

Mr. McClure sold AEG insurance for? 6 7

A. Until May of '07, I believe.

8 And if we use your range of '05, '06 to May of '07, we'll just -- for purposes of this

deposition, we'll call it about a year; okay?

A. Yes.

Ω Just for our purposes of discussion. During that year period of selling AEG insurance, how long during that period did Brimar administer claims for AEG?

A. The entire time.

Q. And did Brimar administer claims after McClure stopped selling AEG insurance?

A No

20 Q. So once McClure ceased selling AEG 21 insurance, Brimar ceased administering those

22 claims?

> A. I had a cease and desist order from the State, as did McClure and Associates.

1 (WHEREUPON, a short break was 2 taken.)

3 BY MR. RICE:

Q. Before the break we were talking about 4 McClure and Ciarrachi and Associates, the funnel 5 account that was created. 6

A. Mm-hmm. 7

10

11

18

2.0

8 Q. Besides you and Mr. McClure, who else was involved in that LLC? 9

A. I don't believe anybody else is.

Q. Do you know when the McClure and

Ciarrachi LLC was formed? 12 13

A. At the same time as the Brimar LLC, I

14 believe. And again, I'm guessing here, I'm not 100

15 percent certain because you're going into an area

of accounting that I'm not familiar with and I

don't normally keep track of. 17

Q. And does Brimar and McClure and

19 Associates share the same accountant?

A. Yes.

Q. And who is your accountant? 21

Howard Gamer. 22 A.

23 Q. Is that G-A-M-E-R?

Mm-hmm.

Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

27

1 Q. You understood the cease and desist 2 order that you received to mean that you could no 3

longer administer claims also?

A. I took it to mean I couldn't do anything 4 5 relative to the AEG program.

Q. Is Brimar still receiving claims involving AEG insurance?

8 A. Receiving claims, are you talking about incurred but not reported claims? I'm not sure --9 10 you have to define what -- when you're asking me 11 that question --

Q. Okay.

6

7

12

19

24

11

12

14

21

13 A. -- as to what you mean by receiving 14

15 Q. If a -- well, I guess we'll come back to 16 that.

17 Were you in any way involved in the 18 selling of AEG insurance?

A. I would be out on all proposals to 20 discuss the facet of the program we were 21 presenting, yes.

Q. So you would accompany Mr. McClure in 22 23 those proposals?

A. Any of the producers who we have here.

Staffing. 1.

2 Q. Was he the person that recommended AEG 3 to you?

4 A. Yes, he -- yes, he came in here after 5 our initial meeting and talked about AEG and the 6 ability for AEG/RCA to sell what I would call 7 non-traditional accounts such as staffing services,

8 roofing companies, more difficult non-standard 9

market risks.

13

17

18

19

20

21

5

15

10 Q. I believe Mr. McClure testified that he 11 understood AEG to be offering a product for higher risk clients. Would that be a fair assessment? 12

Non-standard, yes.

Q. Do you know why McClure would recommend 14 15 AEG insurance to one of its client as opposed to 16 another insurance company?

A. Well, the main reason, the reason I just outlined, they were doing non-standard product.

Q. So did you understand it to mean that they would get a better rate through AEG than somebody else?

22 A. Not necessarily. They could provide 23 coverage that some other carrier would not be willing to provide because it was non -- non --24

Q. And what would your role be during 1 2 this -- the presentation process?

3 A. Talk about the program, the way the 4 program was administered, the way the program

5 set up, the way I understood the total coverage

issues to be -- to be set in the eyes of the State 6 7 of Illinois.

8 Q. My understanding from Mr. McClure is that he dealt with a Mike Ward at AEG. Does that name sound familiar? 10

Yes. Α.

Have you ever met Mike Ward? Q.

13 Α. Yes.

When did you first meet him?

15 My first meeting with him was when he was in a -- a risk manager for a company called 16 17 Elite Staffing.

Q. Do you recall approximately when that 18 was? 19

2/4, 2/5, something like that. 20 Α.

Q. February of '05?

22 A. No, '04 or '05, I'm not sure which year

it was. We went in there to try to sell Elite

Staffing and he was the risk manager for Elite

1 non-acceptable product to the mainstream industry.

2 Q. Do you know approximately how many 3 worker's comp insurance carriers McClure placed 4 coverage for?

A. How many policyholders we wrote --

6 Q. No, I'm sorry, how many carriers did 7

McClure offer to its clients if they were looking

for worker's compensation insurance?

MR. SCOLARO: Objection to the extent that 10 my -- Dave was not the -- privy to some of those conversations, but to the extent that he knows the 11 answer to that question and can outline it, he can 12 go ahead and answer. 13

14 BY THE WITNESS:

A. We would talk about the markets that we 16 had. We had, you know -- we hold the contracts 17 with numerous markets, so we would talk about our 18 ability, if, in fact, we knew the market had the potential to write that class of business, we would 19 talk about those companies. 20

21 BY MR. RICE:

22 Q. And when you say "market", what do you 23 mean?

2.4 A. Well, a market is the industry. I mean,



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

1.8

19

20

21

22

24

4

5

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

31

if I talk to you about the insurance market, I'm

talking to you about the industry as a whole, the

carriers within the market. 3

Q. If I were a staffing company that came 4

to McClure and Associates to seek coverage for my 5

6 worker's compensation --

A. Yes.

7

8

16

24

1

3

11

12

13

14 15 Q. -- exposure?

A. Yes. 9

Q. Do you know the process in which it 10

11 would be decided that I would be placed with AEG

versus some other company, do you know that 12

13

14 A. It would be a case of us telling them

15 these are carriers that are involved in writing

that product, and these are the ones that we've had

the most success in placing business with and these 17 18

are the ones that are competitive in price range. 19

Q. And do you know approximately how many, 20 you know, carriers offered worker's compensation

products that were in your pool of availability for 21

22 clients?

A. For? 23

Q. Four? Do you know --

A. No, I'm saying for what? You've got to 2 be more specific.

Q. Again, using my example, if I came in

here looking for worker's compensation insurance, 4

5 you said that you would tell this prospective

client that you had certain carriers that would

write that particular product; right?

A. Yes, but you have to be specific to 8 product because all carriers don't write all 9 products. 10

Q. And I'm using the product of worker's compensation insurance.

A. To the extent that I talk about a product, I'm talking about your industry.

Q. Okay. So --

16 A. So you would have to tell me what your 17 product is for me to tell you if the carrier would 18 be willing to write it.

19 Q. So let's use my example as a staffing company. 20

21 A. Okay.

Q. If I came to you looking for worker's

compensation for my staffing company, how many

different carriers would McClure and Associates

1 have to offer me?

2 A. Then it would depend on the type of 3 program you wanted, it would depend upon the

of your premium, and so there are var -- there are

5 variables to carriers who will write your product 6

in your example.

Q. Okay. Do you have a finite number of carriers you can use to write any product for, for example, staffing companies?

A. When you define finite, you mean unlimited?

Q. No, I mean -- there are certain carriers McClure and Associates does not write business correct?

A. That's right. You have to have a contract to write business for them.

Q. How many contracts do you have with carriers that write worker's compensation insurance?

A. I would be guessing, but I would say eight to ten.

Q. And would that be the same number approximately during -- that you had contracts during the time frame in which McClure was

30

AEG business? 1

2 A. Contracts but not contracts that would 3 write staffing services.

Q. How many contracts did you have with companies that wrote worker's compensation insurance for staffing clients?

A. Depending on the size -- again, I 8 would -- you know, this is a very limited question 9 that I could respond to because it isn't as simple as saying you walk in the door and say I want 10

11 insurance and I'm a staffing service, you know. 12 There are qualifiers for every carrier, you know,

you'd have to tell me if you have drug testing, you would have to tell me the size of your premium, you 15 would have to tell me the nature of your work.

In other words, some carriers will not write staffing services that do heavy construction, they won't write it if they do heavy industry. I mean, it varies. So every question we would ask you would be to determine who -- which carrier would best fit your risk.

Q. If you had, using your number, eight contracts with eight clients -- or carriers that could sell worker's comp insurance to anybody --



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

Suite 1200 311 West Monroe Street Chicago, IL 60606 www.esquiresolutions.com

32

April 27, 2010

33 1 A. Yes. 1 Q. Well, my question originally was did you 2 do any investigation into the solvency of AEG? 2 -- the questions you would be asking the A. I did investigation into the potential client would only narrow the number of 3 options you had available to you out of the eight? 4 relationship between AEG and RCA. A. That's right. Q. And that rela -- that investigation that 6 So you're not going to go outside of the you performed occurred after you heard some 7 eight you have because you don't have a contract 7 that possibly there might be some problems 8 their relationship ---8 with them? A. That's right. 9 9 A. Right, couldn't do it. 10 Q. -- RCA and AEG; correct? 10 Q. So that's what I wanted to know. A. Mm-hmm. 11 A. Yes. 11 Q. Because you were involved in the 12 Q. Okay. And obviously, that investigation 12 occurred after McClure had already started placing 13 presentation of AEG insurance to potential clients. did you do any investigation yourself into the clients with AEG; right? 14 14 solvency of AEG? 15 A. Which is standard in the industry. If a 15 A. Yes. 1.6 carrier walks in the door, you don't typically do a 16 Q. What investigation did you do? 17 background check on the carrier. There's an 17 18 A. I called -- I called RCA -- as I 18 assumption of professionalism in the industry that 19 understood the program to be, AEG was a fronting 19 if somebody is presenting you with a product and 20 company for RCA. And when I say "fronting 20 presenting you with a carrier, that they're a legitimate admitted carrier to the State of 21 company," typically in this industry, a group of 21 investors will put up a certain amount of risk 22 Illinois. 2.2 money that they themselves will be responsible for 23 Q. Do you know who you spoke with at RCA 23 and there will be excess insurance over and above 24 when you called them? 24 34 36 that. And it was my understanding that AEG was the A. Didn't speak with anybody because they 1 1 fronting company, that RCA was the excess carrier. 2 2 never returned my call. So I called RCA, I called a company called Monument 3 3 Did you ever write them? 4 Insurance Agency, which was the agency that 4 Α. supposedly put together RCA and AEG, and I also You said you also contacted a company 6 called the Department of Insurance in the State of call Monument; correct? 6 7 Illinois. 7 Α. Yes. Q. Monument, is that what --8 8 Q. And that was after you tried to call Monument, yes. 9 9 RCA? Q. Do you know where they're based out of? 10 10 A. That's right. 11 A. They were in New York. The state, I Q. And did you ever speak with anyone at 11 couldn't -- I mean, the city, I couldn't tell you. 12 12 Monument? Q. Did you call RCA before any clients were 13 13 A. No, they never returned my call. I left placed with AEG? 14 14 voicemail messages with them on numerous A. No, I called them as -- we went into the 1.5 Q. Do you know who you called? 1.5

process -- I had heard rumors to the effect that

there may be some issues with the relationship 17

18 between RCA and AEG, and I wanted to check on those

19 issues to determine if there was any credibility to

20

16

Q. Okay. So your investigation into the 21

22 solvency of AEG and RCA --

A. I don't think "solvency" is the right 23

word. The relationship is what I was checking on. 24

A. It was -- who I called directly, no. I was calling Monument to see if they could direct to the person who was handling the AEG/RCA relationship.

20 Q. And did you ever follow up with them in 21 writing?

22 A. No.

16

17

18

19

23

24

And then finally, you said you contacted

the Department of Insurance; correct?



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

April 27, 2010

37 39 BY MR. RICE: 1 A. That's right. 1 2 Q. During the course of discovery in this And this was after your calls to RCA and 2 3 case, a certificate of insurance was produced Monument were unreturned? 3 relating to -- purportedly relating to an insurance 4 A. That's right. 5 Okay. And did you end up speaking with 5 policy that RCA had issued above and beyond the anyone at the Department of Insurance? 6 insurance. Are you familiar with that certificate? 7 7 A. Yes. 8 Do you know who you spoke to? 8 Q. Okay. What did you understand that Q. A. Name, I do not recall. He identified 9 certificate to represent? 9 himself as the chief investigator for the 10 A. Exactly as I outlined earlier, that 10 11 there was an excess carrier and a funnel carrier. 11 Department of Insurance. Q. Okay. Did you do any investigation into 12 Q. Do you recall approximately when you 12 spoke to him or her? 13 the certificate of insurance, meaning did you 13 14 A. You mean the year and the date? 14 contact RCA to request a copy of the insurance policy that was identified on the certificate? 15 Q. Approximately. 15 '07, mid -- early, January, February, 16 A. I've already answered that, I called 16 maybe late of '06, something in that time frame. 17 RCA and I called -- I called RCA and Monument 17 relative to that issue. 18 Q. So sometime '06 to '07? 18 Q. Well, you had indicated earlier that you 19 A. Mm-hmm. 19 contacted RCA to discuss a potential problem 20 O. Do you recall the substance of your 20 conversation with them? 21 between RCA --21 22 A. That was the problem. 22 A. Yes. 23 What was the problem? Q. What was the substance? 23 The problem that I was not certain that It was very basic and very brief, any 24 38 40 issues between RCA and AEG, any problems that the 1 there were not issues. 1 State has seen between the two of them. 2 Q. Between their relationship? 2 Q. And what was the response? 3 That's right. 3 A. No. 4 Okay. When did you get the certificate 4 5 Q. So the Department of Insurance told you 5 of insurance? back in 2006/07 that there were no problems between A. I don't recall that. 7 RCA and AEG? 7 Q. So your conversation to RCA after you A. That's right. I then followed with a 8 heard rumors about a potential problem was letter to the Department of Insurance that would investigate the relationship between them two and 9 9 confirm our conversation and I never received a part of that investigation was to follow up on what 10 1.0 was said on the certificate? response back. 1.1 11 Q. So you sent them a letter? A. Yes. Well, that was the premise of it. 12 12 13 A. Yes. 13 Q. Okay. And the premise being you wanted Q. Okay. Did you retain a copy of that to make sure there was insurance? 14 14 15 letter? 15 A. The premise was that there was a A. Yes. 16 legitimate certificate and a legitimate 16 MR. RICE: I'm not sure if it's been produced, relationship. 17 17 but if it has --Q. Were you in any way involved in 18 18 MR. SCOLARO: I'm 90 percent sure it has, but determining AEG's A.M. Best rating? 19 19 if you don't have a copy, sure, we can certainly do 20 20 A. AEG was the fronting company, they would that. I believe it also might be an exhibit to the 21 not have had a rating. 21 counterclaim but I'm not quite sure. Q. How about a rating for RCA? 22 22

23

24



MR. RICE: Okay.

23

24

Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

A. RCA was the excess carrier and I never

made contact with them, as I just indicated.

April 27, 2010

44

41 of a potential problem with AEG and RCA, which Q. So the answer is you did not verify 1 provoked you to contact RCA to verify that; right? 2 their A.M. Best rating; correct? 3 Do you know how you became aware of that problem? 3 Okay. And you would not have verified 4 A. It was just a -- it was more of a 5 discomfort level on my part. I was not comfortable 5 it prior to writing the business with AEG; correct? 6 A. Writing the business with whom? 6 with questions I would ask Mr. Ward and his 7 Q. AEG? 7 responses, so I decided to do a due diligence on my 8 part by making the phone calls to the people who 8 A. Well, they were one and the same. There 9 were primary to any insurance operation, which 9 were not two different entities, they were one and would have been the carrier, the agency and the 1.0 10 the same. State. Q. My question is -- McClure started 11 11 writing AEG business sometime in, I believe we said 12 And do you recall when that level of 12 13 discomfort set upon you? 13 2005/06 to May of '07? A. That's right. 1.4 A. It was created during the period of time 14 Q. Were you involved in any way in 15 in our relationship, it was an ongoing thing. 15 16 Q. Okay. So was this during the time 16

verifying RCA's A.M. Best rating before that

17 business was written?

A. I myself, no.

Q. I'm sure you're familiar with the

20 Illinois Insurance Guaranty Fund; correct?

21 A. Yes.

18 19

24

1

2

9

10

11

23

Q. Did you believe in any way that the fund 22

would step in to pay claims made involving AEG 23

after AEG became insolvent?

A. Yes, because RCA was an admitted carrier, and the admitted carrier in the State of

Illinois has to pay boards and bureaus, which go to 3

the Guaranty Fund. 4

Q. Okay. And did you ever receive a 5 6 response from the Guaranty Fund with respect to

7 these claims?

A. After the fact? 8

Q. After AEG become insolvent.

A. No, we received a -- our conversations were all with the office of the special deputy. I

am not certain if they're connected with the 12

Guaranty Fund or not, but it was the office of the 13

special deputy who was involved from that point on. 14

Q. Okay. And when you say "that point on," 15 you mean from after they became insolvent? 16

A. After May of '07, when the office --17 18 when the Department of Insurance came in and said 19 we have a cease and desist order.

Q. Have you ever had any contact directly 20 21 with the Guaranty Fund?

A. Not the Guaranty Fund, only the office 22

Q. You had mentioned that you caught word 24

BY MR. RICE: 1

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2

10

12

16

21

42

Q. Mr. Ciarrachi, I'm showing you what's been marked as Exhibit 1 for your deposition. Take

a moment to look at that and let me know when

A. Mm-hmm. I'm familiar with the basic

period in which AEG business was still being

(WHEREUPON, a certain document

was marked Ciarrachi Deposition

Exhibit No. 1, for identification,

as of April 27, 2010.)

you're finished.

premise of this.

Q. Okay. So my first question is do you 8 recognize Exhibit 1? 9

A. Yes.

written by McClure?

A. Yes.

111

And do you know what it is? 11

It's a cease and desist.

Q. Okay. Is it the cease and desist order 13

14 that you talked about earlier from the -- that you

received? 15

A. Yes.

17 Q. You'll see on Page 1 of Exhibit 1, there 18 are four entities listed in the "To" box. Do you

19 see that?

A. Yes. 20

Q. Okay. I'm obviously familiar with

22 Mr. McClure and McClure and Associates. Again,

there's the Brimar Industries, that was the sole 23

proprietorship? 24



of the special deputy.

Toll Free: 800,708,8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

2

6

7

10

1.2

13

14

17

1

16

21

23

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

47

48

A. I have no idea what that is.

2 Q. Okay. No idea what that is.

And then Brimar Claims Administrative

4 Company, again, I assume -

A. We've talked about that.

Q. Is that just a misnomer on the part of

7 the State?

1

3

5

6

17

18

20

22

24

3

4

8

12

14

15

22

8 A. I have no idea. I didn't prepare this

9 document, I received the document.

1.0 Q. Okay. Brimar Administration has never 11 gone by Brimar Claims Administrative; correct?

12 A. Brimar Claims Administrative Company, is

13 that what you're asking me about or Brimar

14 Industries?

15 Q. We know Brimar Industries never existed.

16 right, Or you don't know about it?

A. I don't know anything about it.

Q. Okay. What about Brimar Claims

19 Administrative Co.?

A. Yes, that's what we've talked about

earlier in our conversation. 21

Q. You mentioned earlier Brimar

Administration, LLC. Is that the same thing? 23

A. Same thing.

46

1 Q. Did Brimar Administration ever go by that name, Brimar Claims Administrative Co.? 2

MR. SCOLARO: Objection: Asked and answered,

but to the extent that my client knows the

5 difference between the two, if there is a

6 difference, he can go ahead and answer.

7 BY THE WITNESS:

A. I don't know the difference between the

two. I assume they were the same thing. 9

BY MR. RICE: 1.0

Q. If you take a look at Page 4 of 11

Exhibit 1, in the middle of the page, the document

13 dated July 5th of 2007, do you see that?

A. Yes.

Q. Do you believe you received this

16 document at or around that time?

17 A. I couldn't tell you for sure. There's

18 no way that I could tell you that.

19 Q. Okay. And do you have any independent

20 recollection of when you received this document? 21

A. No, but I do recall receiving it.

Q. Okay. What did you understand Exhibit 1

23 to mean?

A. Exactly what it said, not -- not to do 24

anything relative to the AEG/RCA program. 1

I, furthermore, had a discussion with

3 the office of the special deputy about -- and maybe

4 I should ask you first without -- what I'm about to

5 say because I'm not certain --

MR. SCOLARO: Well, I would just -- answer the

question to the best of your recollection. To the

8 extent it involves any conversations that you and I

9

THE WITNESS: It wasn't a conversation --

11 Jeff, you weren't even involved at that time.

BY THE WITNESS:

A. But we met with the office of the

special deputy. I requested a meeting with them.

15 We discussed a myriad of cases and we said, "How 16

should we go about these cases."

We presented numerous options that we

18 felt we needed to move forward with, and the

19 premise was to try to limit the damages, because

20 from day one in insurance, the obligation of the

21 insured is to limit the damages, which is what

we -- our attempt was in meeting with the office of 22

23 the special deputy. We presented special --24

specific options to them.

We specifically talked about Genie

2 Temporary Services because there was a case that

3 had been heard, had an award made to a gentleman,

4 and we wanted to go into that specific discussion.

5 The arbitrator had affixed penalties on top of the

award. And we said to them, "You understand that

this is a building claim and we're under a cease

8 and desist and, thus, we can do nothing about it?"

BY MR. RICE: 9

Q. Okay. So this conversation that you 10 11 just mentioned with the Department of Insurance --

12 A. Yes -- not with the Department of

Insurance, with the office of the special deputy. 13

Q. That occurred after you received the

15 cease and desist order?

A. Yes.

17 Q. Okay. And what was the resolution or

18 the recommendation given to you after you had this

19 conversation?

20 A. Specifically about the Genie case?

Q.

A. I was told to forward the Genie case to 22

the office of the special deputy and that they

24 could go to the courts and get the penalties



Toll Free: 800,708,8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

1

2

3

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

10

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

52

A. From the premiums from the insureds that

Q. When -- okay, so just so I'm clear, we

where McClure was writing AEG business; okay?

Q. During that time period, policy premiums

Q. Okay. McClure would then deposit those

Q. And then the money over time accumulated

A. No. The money that we're talking about

was segregated money after the cease and desist

money that that perhaps two-month period of time,

Q. Okay. So the money that was collected by McClure and Associates during the year in which

Q. - that money would be forwarded on to

there didn't seem to be a problem with AEG --

after the issues with the State developed, it was

had a year period, approximately a year period

we had written under the AEG program.

were paid directly to McClure; right?

funds into its client trust account?

A. That's right.

A. That's right.

A. That's right.

A. That's right.

to this 1.4 million?

removed. 1

2 Q. Okay. And do you know if that ever

3 happened?

A. That it was forwarded or that they had 4

5 it removed?

6 Q. Both.

7

9

21

6

12

15

16

18

A. It was forwarded. Did they have them

8 removed, I have no idea.

Q. Did you discuss with the special deputy 10 how to process or handle any claims in addition to

the one you just spoke about with Genie? 11

12 A. We had a discussion about the fact that

13 we had to protect our reputation. We've been in

business 20-plus years and we were concerned 14

the damages to our reputation in terms of our loss 15

of business. And so the discussion with the office 16

17 of the special deputy is, you know, "Do you have an

objection to us moving forward and working with our 18

19 insureds who had outstanding claims to try to

20

resolve those?"

Q. Okay. My understanding from talking

with Mr. McClure is that at some point, there was 22

money held by McClure and Ciarrachi or McClure 23

Associates or Brimar to the tune of approximately

50

AEG as just any other premium would to a carrier; 1.

that that specific time frame money.

right? 2

3 Yes.

4 Q. Okay. It wasn't until the cease and

desist order came down that you had a window now of

time where the cease and desist order and this 6

two-month period where you were collecting premiums

8 but you didn't have anybody to give it to?

9 A. Well, we could have given it to AEG.

Q. Right. But you chose not to do that?

11 A. We chose not to do that.

Q. So at some point, then, you had this 12

\$1.4 million and then you just gave it back to the 13

special deputy; right? 14

A. Not willingly, at their request. 15

Q. Do you know what happened with that 16

17 money?

18 A. No idea.

19 Q. Okay. Do you ever get reports from the

special deputy?

21 A. No

Q. Okay. Have you made any contacts 22

yourself with the special deputy since the time in 23

which the money has been released?

\$1.3 million? 1 2

A. That's right.

Q. That money was eventually turned over to 3

the special deputy; correct? 4 5

A. That's right.

Q. Were you -- was it your intention to use

those funds to pay claims? 8

A. We called the Department of Insurance

first to receive -- this money that he's speaking 9

about is insurance premiums that we had received 10

11 from our policyholders.

Q. Okay.

A. So we called -- and as you know, 13

premiums should go in your premium trust account. 14

Q. Right.

A. So we asked them permission to put it in

a separate account because we were concerned 17

commingling AEG premiums with our premium trust 19 account. And we received permission to do that,

and the objective initially was that that money

would be used then to pay down claims that had

22 existed for our policyholders.

23 Q. Okay. I still don't know how the money

24 accumulated that much --



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

April 27, 2010

53 Many. 1 Q. So about approximately two months before 1 Α. they issued a cease and desist order, somebody 2 Okay. And what has been your general 3 comes here to tell you there's a problem? response from them? 3 4 A. That's right. 4 A. None. 5 Q. Do you try to call them? 5 Q. Okay. Prior to the individual coming to Call them, write them. your office in May of '07, did you have any Q. Okay. And you've gotten zero response 7 inclination that there was a problem with RCA and 7 from them? 8 AEG? 8 A. Well --9 A. Exactly. 9 10 MR. SCOLARO: Objection to the extent it was 10 Q. Okay. A. And we've also worked with our attorneys 11 asked and answered 11 12 BY THE WITNESS: 12 to do the same thing. Q. Okay. Do you know how many policies 13 A. I've answered that question. I -- by 13 McClure and Associates issued involving AEG a 14 contacting the State of Illinois, they specifically 14 told me there wasn't. 15 prior to the cease and desist order? 15 A. No. 16 BY MR. RICE: 16 Q. Were you aware of any problems with AEG 17 Q. Okay. And I apologize, my question then 17 is from the time that you convinced yourself that 18 and RCA between the time in which you were 18 there was no problem by contacting the Department 19 convinced after calling the Department of 19 of Insurance to the time when somebody came here 20 Insurance -- strike that for a second. Start over. 20 and told you there was a problem, you had no You talked about your own suspicions 21 21 22 indication in between that period; right? 22 that you tried to relieve by contacting RCA, A. No. As a matter of fact, I had Monument and then finally the Department of 23 23 alleviated my fears by having the Department of Insurance. You spoke to the Department of 54 Insurance, they said there was no problem, so you Insurance telling me that there weren't problems. 1 1 went about your business and then, lo and behold, 2 (WHEREUPON, a certain document 2 here comes the cease and desist order; right? 3 marked Ciarrachi Deposition Exhibit 3 A. No, person from the Department of 4 No. 2, for identification, as of 4 5 Insurance came into the office. 5 April 27, 2010.) 6 Q. Okay. So there's somebody -- there was BY MR. RICE: something that happened in between you convincing 7 Q. Mr. Ciarrachi, I'm showing you what's 7 yourself that everything was okay and then, lo and been marked as Exhibit 2 for your deposition. behold, there was a problem, i.e., the cease and take a moment to look at that and let me know 9 9 desist order? vou're finished. 10 10 11 A. That's right, yes. A. I'm familiar with it. 11 12 What was that event? 12 Okay. So that's my question, do you 13 A. A person from either the office -- it 13 recognize the document? was either from Department of Insurance or the 14 A. Yep. 15 office of the special deputy came in here and told 15 Q. Okay. And what is it? 16 us that they had been investigating the RCA/AEG 16 Α. Stipulation and consent order. relationship. 17 1.7 Q. Did you receive a copy of this document? Q. And do you know approximately when that 18 18 Α. person came to the office? Q. Is that your signature on Page 5 of 19 19 A. Sometime in May of '07. Exhibit 2? 20 20 21 Q. May of '07. Okay. 21 A. One of them. So if -- using the date that's on Q. Do you recognize any other signatures on 22 22 Exhibit 1, which I believe was July of '07? 23 23 Page 5?

2.4

A. Yes.



A. July 5th of '07.

2.4

Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

April 27, 2010

57 59 1 Q. Which signature? 1 answer the question. 2 Brian McClure, Barbara Gast. 2 BY THE WITNESS: 3 A. I don't recall. I mean, we had another 3 Okay. And is that your signature next 4 to Brimar Investigations, LTD? attorney involved initially before the Scolaro 5 5 firm, Jeff got involved, so we may have discussed A. Yes. 6 it with them, I don't recall. Q. What did you understand Exhibit 2 to 6 7 BY MR. RICE: 7 mean when you signed it? 8 Q. Did you have any conversations with 8 A. To present to the office -- to -- to 9 the -- I take it this was to the Department of 9 Mr. McClure about it? Insurance -- or actually, it was -- our dealings 10 A. To the specific -- I imagine I did, but I could not specifically tell you that there was a 11 were always with the office of the special deputy, 11 despite the fact that this came from the Department 12 time or place. 12 of Insurance, to provide to them the itemizations 13 Q. I want to talk just briefly about the 1.3 claims -- do you want to take a break? I'm sorry. that they requested on Page 3 of this document. 14 14 THE WITNESS: I do, I'd like to go to the 15 15 They sent a -- the office of the special 16 deputy sent a person in here who was in here about 16 washroom. (WHEREUPON, a short break was six or seven weeks looking through AEG files. 17 17 Q. Okay. So is it fair to say that the 18 18 taken.) document, Exhibit 2, which you signed, was 19 BY MR. RICE: 19 essentially laying out the things you agreed to do 2.0 Q. Before we took a break, I just wanted to 2.0 in connection with the Department's investigation? 21 ask you some questions about AEG claims 21 Do you know approximately how many claims had 22 A. Yes. That's the way I took it anyway. 22 made involving AEG? 23 Q. So Items 1 through 8 listed on Page 3 of 23 Exhibit 2 are the things that McClure and Brimar 24 A. No. 58 60 were to do in connection with the investigation? Q. Okay. I was fortunate enough to come 1 1 2 A. Mm-hmm. here on Friday and look at a number of bankers 2 Q. Whether it be not doing something or boxes, some of them which are in the room right 3 doing something to help them? now, which I understand to be boxes that contain 5 A. Yeah, mm-hmm. all of the claim files that had been submitted --Q. What did you do when you -- strike that. or all of the claims that had been submitted that 6 7 Did you work with the Department to involve AEG insurance. Do you understand that to 7 create this document or did they just create it and 8 8 be true with what's in these boxes? 9 send it to you? 9 A. No, I have no idea what's in the boxes, 10 A. They created it and sent it to me. 10 I wasn't involved in that. Q. This is not something that Brimar would 11 Q. Did they have any conversations with you 11 12 about it when you signed it? 12 take care of? A. No -- well, I mean, the producers 13 A. No. 13 Q. Okay. Was it something that was just probably put these in there because the way we 14 14 ultimately decided to go about resolving mailed to you, you signed it and returned it? 15 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24



the document with anybody?

conversations and/or documents.

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

A. I don't know if it was mailed or if it

was brought by a special deputy, I don't recall,

but I do remember receiving it. How, I don't know.

MR. SCOLARO: Objection to the extent it calls

Q. Before you signed it, did you discuss

But to the extent it doesn't, you can

for disclosure of attorney-client privileged

Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

outstanding cases was that each producer would

contribute towards any settlements that were made

on behalf of the claims that were presented in the

Q. After the cease and desist was entered,

Q. Okay. There was a time period when

Brimar and/or McClure received claims involving AEG

AEG program by our agency directly.

insurance; is that fair?

A. Yes.

3

4

5

12

17

18

22

4

6

7

62

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

63

64

you're receiving these claims that you felt you couldn't do anything with them because your hands

were tied by the government; right? 3

A. We had a cease and desist.

Q. Okay. It's my understanding, though, at some point, Brimar and/or McClure elected to start paying these claims directly; is this accurate?

A. After they released the cease and desist order.

10 Q. And do you know when that release occurred? 11

12 A. No.

4

5

7

8

9

22

8

12

13

14

15

17

18

19

20

13 Q. Okay. Do you know approximately -- do you have any recollection of when the first claim 14 was paid directly by Brimar and McClure and 15 16 Associates?

A. Let me back up a minute. When we had 17 the office of the special deputy in here, we had 18 19 reached a verbal agreement with them that we 20 be able to pay off of that \$1.5 million that we had 21 given them claims for the AEG/RCA program.

Q. Okay.

A. In the middle of their presence here, 23 and I want to say two or three weeks into it, the

cannot send these checks out." 1

Q. Okay. So the best of your knowledge, no claims were paid out of money that was eventually turned over to the government; right?

A. By us, no.

6 Okay. During that time period where you 7 were sending out checks -- or that you were going 8 to make payments but you decided not to send out the checks because they told you not to, did you 9 10 ever end up writing personal checks to cover those expenses? 11

A. No, not during that period of time.

Q. Okay. After the government seized the 13 14 money, the premium money, did McClure and 15 Ciarrachi, the funnel account, start making payments to claims? 16

A. After we had the cease and desist order removed, we started paying claims, yes.

19 Okay. And you do not recall when that 20 was?

21 Α. No, I don't know.

> Q. Okay.

And I may add here that the reason we 23 made those payments was to limit damages. 24

person who represented the office of the special 1 deputy received a phone call from his supervisor, 2

3 and they said do not send any of those checks out,

they could not be paid.

Q. Okay. So -- and again, I'm just trying to understand the timeline, the cease and desist 6 7 order happens.

A. Yes.

Q. You're holding onto funds because you 9 have these people paying for premiums that you're 10 not going to send over to AEG; right? 11

A. That's right.

Q. At some point, you have a conversation with the special deputy and they say, "We're going to allow to you make payments to claims that are

coming in using those premiums;" correct? 16

A. That's right.

Q. And then at some point after that, they say, "No more, give us the money, we don't want you making any payments and any of the checks you

21 wrote, we're not cashing them"?

A. We actually -- I think we still got 22

copies of the checks we wrote, but they never were 23

sent out because they said at that point, "You

Q. Okay. Who within this office is in

1 charge of handling these claims as they come in, 2

AEG claims? 3

A. You mean now or then?

Q. Let's do now first.

A. Well, I would see the majority of them,

I'd probably see all of them, as a matter of fact.

8 Q. Okay. When I looked at these boxes that 9 are in the room right now, these are documents that 10 were produced by McClure and Associates and/or

Brimar as claim files involving AEG. When I look 11

at the boxes, I see that on the outside of them 12

13 some of them are marked what I believe to be --

might be overall clients. So you have like a PTO, 14

you have Genie, you've got -- I know there's some 15

cab company boxes back there, too. Do you know 16 17

approximately how many clients, and when I say

18 "clients," I mean just a company, AEG business was 19

placed with?

20 A. No.

21

23

24

Q. Okay. Do you think that number is

smaller than 10? 22

A. It would be larger than 10.

Okay. I think the number was about 25



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

2

3

6

7

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

67

68

that I heard before. Does that sound about right?

- 2 A. I wouldn't know.
 - Okay. Are you still receiving AEG
- 4 claims today?

3

16

17

24

6

- 5 A. I want to say rarely. I mean, there may
- be an isolated incident where you'll see that 6
- happen. But, typically, as you know, workers' 7
- compensation has a statute of limitations, and the
- 9 statute of limitations for AEG business would have
- 10 expired.
- 11 Q. Okay.
- 12 So if, hypothetically, a claim were out there under that coverage term, statute of 13
- limitations would have expired and they would not 14
- be able to present a claim. 15
 - Q. Okay. So I know that when Mr. McClure was deposed, he talked about after the cease and
- desist order, there was an effort by McClure and 18
- Associates to either get new policies in place from 19
- 20 a company, I think Dallas National, to either pick
- up where certain policies were to terminate or just 21
- 22 switch the business over to them?
- 23 A. Which we did.
 - Okay. So at this point, we're starting
 - 66
- to hit the bookend of any claims that could come in 1
- involving AEG because the workers' compensation
- statute of limitations would basically prevent 3
- those people from making claims?
- A. Are you talking about today? 5
 - Q. Today, correct.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Okay. So it's fair to say that we're
- hopefully on the back end of any new claims coming 9 10 in; right?
- A. Hope so. 11
- Q. Okay. So any claims that had been made 12
- to you during the time period of the cease and 13
- desist order until this bookend we hope we're at, 14
- the claim files would be here; right? 15
- A. Yes. Well, either here or with the 16
- office of the special deputy. 17
- Q. Are there certain claims that Brimar 18
- 19 forwarded directly on to the office of special
- 20 deputy?
- A. We forwarded all of them, I believe. 21
- Q. Okay. So when I look at these claim 22
- files that are sitting here, are these the 23
- originals and you made copies and sent them to the

- 1 special deputy?
 - A. About four times.
 - Q. Okay. So you believe what is in your
- office, you have a duplicate of what the special
- 5 deputy should have?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. Okay. And all I'm trying to understand
- 8 is there aren't two or three claims that were so
- 9 enormous that you didn't even handle on your own, 1.0
 - you just sent them right away?
- 11 A. I don't believe so, no. I mean, our
- attempt originally would have been to negotiate out 12
- 13 a claim that we felt we could handle, except for
- the Genie-Ramirez claim. Because of the penalties
- that had accumulated on that claim, we were told to 15
- 16 send that one to the office of the special deputy
- 17 and that they would have the ability to take that
- 18 to the courts to have the penalties removed, which
- 19 in my opinion and my opinion only, should never
- 20 have been put on that case by the arbitrator
- 21 because we were under a cease and desist order at
- that time. 22

24

8

11

19

- 23 Q. And to the best of your knowledge,
 - nothing has been done about that; correct?

A. That's right. It's my understanding 1

- that what was done about it is that the owner of 2
- Genie was advised by counsel out of Florida that he 3
- 4 had an obligation to pay the total verdict of that
- claim and that he did, in fact, do that. And now
- he is proceeding in litigation against us for the
- total amount of monies.
 - Q. Okay. After the money was turned over
- to the special deputy, the 1.4 million premium 9
- money ---10
 - A. Yes.
- 12 Q. -- at some point, you and Mr. McClure
- decided that you were going to start mitigating
- your damages by paying money directly out of the 14
- 15 funnel account; correct?
- 16 A. That's right.
- Q. We don't know what date that is, but a 17
- decision like that was made at some point? 18
 - A. It was.
- Q. Okay. Do you know, why was that 20
- decision made to do that? 21
- 22 A. To limit our damages, the Ramirez case
- being a case in point. 23
- Q. Okay. So the purpose of paying these 24



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

8

12

13

14

15

16

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

71

72

claims directly out of your own personal funds was 2 in an effort to reduce those claims before they got too large? 3 4

A. Yes, and also to protect our reputation.

Q. When the business -- well, strike that. Did McClure and/or Brimar have any

7 contracts with any of these clients wherein there 8 was an agreement to pay these claims in the event

the carrier become insolvent? 9

10 A. No, but as an agency, when we sell a 11 product, we're selling a promise to produce payment of a claim when presented, so --

Q. Okay.

5 6

13

19

20

6

10

11

12

13

14

14 A. And it was our attempt to fulfill that 15 promise.

16 Q. Okay. This was not a written contract, though? 17

18 A. No.

Q. Okay.

A. Let me just go into that for just a

2.1 second because when you talk about a written

22 contract, an insurance policy is a written

2.3 contract, we would have had an insurance policy

with them, which basically would have said we're

going to honor and pay claims when they're 1 2 produced?

3 Q. Okay. Are you aware of that being spelled out in any of the policies you've 4 5 ever written?

A. I think it's in every policy written. I mean, your auto policy, your homeowner's every policy written says in case of accident and/or incident, you will make payment for -the carrier, will make payment for.

In this case, the carrier was listed as insolvent, so we, as an agency, felt a moral obligation and a business obligation to make payment.

15 Q. Okay. And those are the same 16 Mr. McClure used during his deposition, a obligation to make these payments. All I'm to confirm is that there isn't any written 19 wherein you had a signature with the client 20 "We will pay this in the event AEG doesn't claim"? 21

A. There is always a written obligation when you issue a policy to make payment for 23 when presented, in an insurance policy.

what you're receiving premium for. It's a --

2 theoretically, it's a promise put on paper because

3 basically insurance is only selling a promise, you

4 promise to pay.

5 Q. And I appreciate your answer. What I'm 6 asking you, though, is that promise generally flows 7 from the carrier to the insured?

A. That's right.

Q. You don't have a separate contract, 9 10 Brimar or McClure, with the insured to make those 11 payments; is that correct?

A. No, that's right.

(WHEREUPON, a certain document was marked Ciarrachi Deposition Exhibit No. 3, for identification, as of

April 27, 2010.)

17 BY MR. RICE:

18 Q. Mr. Ciarrachi, I'm showing you what's 19 been marked as Exhibit 3 to your deposition. Just take a moment to look at it and let me know when 20 21 you're finished.

22 A. I'm familiar with the document, yes. I mean, a letter like this was sent probably to all of the medical providers that were involved in

2

9

12

13

14

17

18

19

20

21

24

workers' compensation claims. 1

Q. Okay. So you do recognize it?

A. Mm-hmm, yes.

3 4 Q. Okay. And you indicated that Exhibit 3 5 is a document that would generally be sent to medical providers for any of the claimants that submitted claims involving workers' comp; is this

accurate? 8

A. Yes.

Q. Would Exhibit 3 have been prepared at or 1.0 near the time that it's dated at the top of Page 1? 11

A. I would imagine.

Q. Okay. And why was this document prepared?

15 A. To inform the medical provider as to 16 what was going on.

Q. And when you say "what was going on," what do you mean?

A. That there was a cease and desist and the issues that had developed with the State, the office of the special deputy, AEG and RCA.

22 Q. Okay. Who would typically prepare this 23 document?

Could be the producer, could be myself,



Toll Free: 800,708,8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

8

9

10

11

13

19

20

21

1

2

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

1.4

15

16

17

18

19

74

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

76

could have been Brian McClure.

2 Q. Okay. Is this a -- is Exhibit 3 a --

like a form letter?

4 A. No -- well, somewhat. I mean, it --

pretty much this is the language used but you could 5

6 change maybe one or two words in there. As an

example, Christopher Jones would not be -- you 7

know, it might be -- here he's listed as the

9 patient with a Social Security number and the

account number, and those obviously would change.

Who it was sent to would obviously be changed. But

12 the crux of the actual correspondence probably

13 would be consistently the same.

Q. Okay. In the letter, Exhibit 3, there's 14

15 a few names I just want to ask you who they were.

Jeff Heller, do you recognize that name?

17 A. Yes.

> Q. Who is that?

19 A. A producer.

2.0 Q. And he's a producer that works for

21 McClure?

16

18

22

2

4

6

8

16

A. That's right.

Q. He does not work for Brimar? 23

24 No, he does not. 2 given patient. 3

Q. Okay. Are you still sending out letters like this, Exhibit 3, to people?

value to the medical that was performed to the

A. Hopefully not. I mean, if we have, it's 6 when one of those isolated cases come in, but I'm 7 not aware of anything like this going on a regular basis, no.

Q. Okay. This would be a letter you'd contact at the inception of the claim just to let them know that there's going to be some delays involved in this because of this issue?

A. That's right.

14 Q. Again, based solely on the number of tabs I see in these boxes, there's a significant 1.5 amount of claimants that have made claims 17 to AEG insurance. Do you know how many of 18 claims are still open claims?

A. As 100 percent -- I could only give you percentages.

Q. Okay. Out of a percentage?

22 A. Out of 100 percent of claims that would 23 have existed, I would say perhaps 90 percent

been resolved.

Q. Does he still work for Mr. McClure? 1

Α.

3 Q. Bill Wall, do you recognize that name?

Α.

5 Who is he?

A producer. Α.

7 Q. Does he still work with Mr. McClure?

Α. Yes.

9 Q. Do you recall ever getting a response to

10 Exhibit 3 from Will County Medical Associates? 11 A. I wouldn't -- there were so many of

these, I couldn't tell you specifically if we did 12 13 or we didn't.

Q. Okay. As a general matter, do you 14 recall getting responses of this type of letter? 15

A. Me, specifically?

Q. 17 Yes.

1.8 A. There would be times I would, there

would be times I wouldn't. We ultimately turned

over all of the medical bills to a resolution

21 company for negotiation, and based on their

personal contacts -- when I say "personal," I'm 22

23 talking about telephonic contact, with the medical

provider, we paid on their resolution of the dollar

Q. 90 percent have been resolved?

A. That's right.

Q. I saw the name of what I believe to be 3 the company you talked about in terms that you

hired to help negotiate --5

A. Austin Resolution.

Q. Austin Resolution. And that was the company you used for all of these?

A. Yes.

Q. Okay. Do you have a list of all of the claims that are closed and opened?

A. I believe so. I can't say that for certainty.

Q. Okay. I know that I've been working with your attorney to try to generate a list like that. Do you believe that you have the resources available to make a list like that if you don't?

A. You know, the way it would -- the way it would happen -- the way I know the claims that -the producers contribute, as I said. Our

20 21 bookkeeper would, when they are given their

22 commissions on a monthly basis, reduce their

23 commissions by any monies they have paid 24 claims.



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

24

1

2

5

11

12

19

them.

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

may have concluded between you and Mr. McClure that

there was a -- it was a questionable claim; right?

Q. And so you elected to retain counsel to

Q. Okay. And of the 10 percent that are

open, do you believe all 10 percent of those are

A. The majority of them, 98 percent of

Q. They're the ones that you're questioning

Q. Aside from the money that came out of

the McClure and Ciarrachi funnel account, did you

receive any other funds from any other source to

Q. And the money that's with -- that is

out of the funnel account is all money that is

either yours or Mr. McClure's personally?

currently in or that was used to pay the AEG claims

A. That's right.

A. That's right.

those types of claims?

the legitimacy of the claim?

A. That's right.

help pay those claims?

A. That's right.

A. No.

defend those claims; correct?

Q. Okay.

1

7

8

9

So she would have those records, which 2

3 would tell you -- if a case was settled at the

Industrial Commission, there would be a contract

drawn up, which, of course, satisfies both the

6 respondent and the petitioner.

Q. Sure.

lost time.

determine.

Q. Okay.

Industrial Commission.

that might still be lingering open?

that I feel are fraudulent that we are not

voluntarily paying and we're defending.

1

2

3

4 5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

And that contract would exist within the file or the statute of limitations would have run

on the file. So for conclusion of a claim, one of

those two would have to exist.

Q. Okay. I notice that in my review of a 12 13 portion of these boxes, and again, there was, I

believe, 12 bankers boxes full of claims, in my

brief review of at least three boxes, I saw inside 15

of there generally a number that represented the 16

17 amount of outstanding medical bills. And then

there would be on the inside sleeve of each file 18

jacket a list of checks that were written by

McClure and Ciarrachi, the check number, the

21 amount. It was difficult for me to deduce whether

the claim was closed, whether the claim had been 2.2

So my question to you before was is

there a way to calculate, one, whether the file was

closed or still open, and ultimately, the amount of

A. Yeah, well, we wrote out of our funnel

account ultimately the monies that we paid out, so

A. As to whether a file is open or closed,

file, the statute of limitations has run or if you

have a settlement for contract at the Illinois

there's only two ways to do that in a workers' comp

Q. Okay. And again, using your percentage,

you think there's maybe only about 10 percent left

A. Yeah, there are one or two cab claims

Q. Okay. I believe -- that's a good point.

there are certain claims that have come in that you

I believe Mr. McClure also mentioned that, that

money that came out of this office to pay it?

that calculation should be fairly easy to

settled for something less than the amount that 23 24

represented by the medical or the time -- you

78

Q. Okay. There are no other premium monies coming in the door for outstanding AEG claims;

correct? 3

4 A. No.

Q. Were you in any way involved in

reporting what I'm going to define to be the loss,

meaning this AEG-related issue, to American

Automobile Insurance Company, the carrier for

9 Mr. McClure?

A. No. 10

Q. So Mr. McClure would handle all of that?

That's right.

Q. Okay. Are you familiar with Lancer 13

14 Claim Services?

15 A. Only in that I saw a letter from them.

16 I assume they were a TPA -- I'm not even sure how

American Automobile is involved with Fireman's 17

Fund. I thought our E&O was with Fireman's Fund. 18

Q. Right.

20 A. And I assume that American Automobile is

a program business spun off of Fireman's Fund and

that Lancer is a TPA hired by American Automobile. 22 23

Q. That is generally correct, yes.

Okay. 24

Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

Suite 1200 311 West Monroe Street Chicago, IL 60606 www.esquiresolutions.com

80

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

8.3

84

1 Q. So you were not involved in notifying American Automobile of the issue, it was

Mr. McClure. I assume then, also, other than

getting the letter you mentioned from Lancer, you

didn't have any direct contact from Lancer either?

A. No, I did not.

Q. Okav.

6

7

8

A. I take that back. I had one

9 conversation, a conference call with somebody from

10 Lancer with Brian McClure. And I don't recall who

the person was. I cannot even recall the context 11

of the conversation, other than trying to explain 12

13 to him the relationship of AEG, RCA and these

claims. And he had a very difficult time 14

understanding it. 15

16 Q. Okay. There is -- were you ever

17 involved in, other than that one conversation, any

discussions with AAIC or Lancer about your and 18

Mr. McClure's intent to seek reimbursement for the

funds you've been paying directly out of your own 20

21 pocket?

22

24

1

2

3

9

A. No. I've had discussions with Jeff

Scolaro and the law firm about that but never with 23

Lancer and/or the program business.

Q. Okay. Do you know approximately how much money has been paid out of the McClure and

Ciarrachi funnel account to satisfy AEG claims? 4 A. Approximately, no, but I could give you

5 a value above a half a million dollars. 6 Q. Okay. And, again, that would have been

approximately a half a million dollars to satisfy

approximately 90 percent of the claim? 8

A. Yes.

So the 10 percent that are still out 1.0

there, we don't know what that amount is going to 11 12

A. That's right. 13

Okay.

A. And those are some heavy claims that are 15

out there. When I say "heavy," I'm talking about 16

17 should we take the case to the Industrial

1.8 Commission and lose, there's one or two claims that

19 could be above 100,000 each.

20 Q. Okay. Part of the subject matter of

this lawsuit involves the claim made by Genie

relating to the one that you spoke about earlier 22

23 involving the penalties and such?

24 A. Yes 1 Q. Are you familiar with Genie as a client

2 of the AEG insurance?

A. Yes

Q. Do you know approximately how many 4

5 workers within Genie have made claims under the AEG

6 program?

3

7

8

1.2

14

20

24

1.0

11

20

21

23

A. No, I do not know the number.

Okay. Do you know if any of the claims

that were made by workers related to Genie, whether 9

any of those claims were paid? 1.0

A. Yes, they were. 11

> Q. Some were?

13 A. Yes.

Okay. Do you know, other than the one

that we talked about earlier that hasn't been paid, 15

16 do you know that any of them that haven't been

17 paid?

18 A. Well, they had -- AEG and RCA and Genie

19 had a relationship where they initially were sold a

policy at one -- I believe -- I'm going off of

memory here, I believe they were sold at one 21

deductible level. They had an onslaught of claims

23 on the initiation of the coverage. So AEG came to

us and said we want to cancel the risk. At that

82

point, we discussed with them an option to 1 canceling the risk, which was raising the deductible. 3

4 So we went out to their Joliet office

and had a conversation with, I believe, their risk

manager or the manager from that office who

purchased the insurance product and said if we

have -- if we're going to keep this insurance in

9 force, AEG has said we must raise your deductible.

Q. Okay.

A. And he agreed to raise the deductible, I believe it's to \$25,000.

12 13

Q. Okay. So initial -- just so I'm understanding correctly, initially Genie was placed 14

with AEG Insurance at a certain deductible, too 15

many claims were coming in and AEG felt that it 16

either -- something had to be done and it was 17

18 either cancelling the program or raising the

19 deductible --

A. Yes.

-- so they at least had their own --

22 A. We talked them into raising the

deductible.

24 Q. Okay. So it's fair to say, then, that



Toll Free: 800,708,8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

April 27, 2010

85 finished. every -- any claim involving Genie that came in 1 2 A. Yes. This -- the entire document you after the raise of the deductible was a claim in excess of \$25,000? 3 want me to review or just a copy of the letter? A. No, no, there were some under 25. 4 Q. If you could just -- I don't want you to 4 read every page of it, I just want --5 Q. Okay. Was it a -- was it a deductible that was eroded by any claim or did every one claim A. I'm familiar with it because this is 6 7 have to exceed \$25,000? something that -- I mean, I was extremely upset 8 about it because I thought the arbitrator 8 A. Every one would have to exceed 25,000. 9 overstepped his bounds. 9 Q. Okay. So if a claim was made that was 10 Q. Okay. 10 under \$25,000, you would still administer the claim? 11 A. And he went and he affixed penalties in 11 We'd administer it, go back to Genie and 12 something under a cease and desist order. 12 A. 13 Q. Okay. So you obviously recognize 13 say ---Exhibit No. 4; is that correct? 14 Q. Pay this directly? 14 A. Pay this directly. 15 A. Yes. 15 Q. Okay. So --16 Q. And what is it? 16 17 Α. It's a notice that they've affixed 17 A. Or defend it directly. Q. Okay. So Genie would still use you for 18 penalties because the original award wasn't 18 19 purposes of either negotiating down the claim 19 Q. And I guess a better question would 20 and/or defending it because this is a ridiculous 20 been what is Page 1 of Exhibit 4, is that a letter 21 claim? 21 you prepared? A. Yes. 22 A. Yes, but to the office of the special 22 23 Q. Okay. If the claim exceeded \$25,000 deputy. 23 24 Q. 24 deductible and you decided to pay the claim, and it And when was this letter prepared? 88 86 was in excess of 25, you would still go back to A. It's dated January 30th, and that was 1 1 them to pay the 25, you'd pay the difference? after I had our -- remember I talked about a 2 discussion we had with the office of the deputy 3 A. That's right. 3 4 Okay. Do you have any independent special about the Ramirez case and the fact they recollection of when Mr. McClure notified AAIC could have penalties taken off, so that was when I about Genie's claim, and the one I'm referring to sent the file over to them per my discussion with 7 is the one that we've talked about before, the one 7 their vice president of claims. Q. Okay. Is that your signature on Page 1 8 that's still outstanding? 8 of Exhibit 4? A. I could only give you an assumption, and 9 I know that's not the proper thing to do in a A. No, that's not mine. I imagine it's my 10 10 deposition, but it's all I can do. And I can tell 11 secretary's. 11 you that it's probably after we received notice Q. Did you authorize her to sign this 12 when we were under cease and desist that penalties letter for you? 13 had been affixed to an award made while a cease 14 A. I'm sure I did. 14 desist was under way. Q. Did you ever receive a response from the 15 15 special deputy --Q. Okay. 16 16 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was A. No. 17 17 18 marked Ciarrachi Deposition Exhibit 18 Q. Let me just finish my question. Did you 19 No. 4, for identification, as of 19 ever receive a response to Exhibit -- from April 27, 2010.) Exhibit 4 from the special deputy? 20 BY MR. RICE: 21 21 A. No. Q. I'm showing you what's been marked as 22 Q. Okay. Did you ever follow up with him 22

about this letter?

23

2.4



Exhibit 4 for your deposition. Take a moment to

review it and just let me know when you're

23

Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

A. In phone conversations and through our

April 27, 2010

91

92

attorney. 1

2 Q. And still to this day, you've never

3 received a response?

4 A. No.

8

9

1.0

16

19

22

23

24

6

8

9

Q. And you have no independent knowledge as 5

you sit here today what their response has been as

to this particular claim?

A. That's right,

Q. Again, I just want to make sure I

understand, those files that are closed involving

AEG claims, you had indicated there's only two ways 11

a file can be closed, either the statute of 12

limitations has expired or you get essentially a 13

14 settlement agreement?

15 A. Yes.

Q. And the agreement would be signed by

Ciarrachi and McClure as well as the claimant, or 17

who would all be a part of that --18

A. I basically would sign off as a

representative of Brimar Administration and the 20

petitioner attorney would sign off. 21

Q. Okay.

A. And the client, the injured employee.

Q. Okay. Because I saw, again, in the

89 determination as far as what coverage he's

> 2 involved, and it calls for a legal conclusion. But

to the extent that he understands the question, he 3

can go ahead and answer. 4

BY THE WITNESS:

6 A. Well, his policy that he purchased was

7 for the -- the administration and the placing of

coverage. It was a policy that it was my

assumption covered the entire LLC of our entire

business operation. 10

11 BY MR. RICE:

5

12

14

Q. Okay. Have you ever seen a copy of the

13 AAIC policy?

A. No, and that was an issue that he and I

15 discussed because no policy was ever issued to As I understood it, we merely received a

certificate of insurance and never the actual 17

18

19 Now, I understand, after we complained 20 about it, you can now go on-line and secure a copy

of the policy. But at the time we wrote that 21

22 policy, we were never actually given a physical

23 policy.

24

2

3

6

7

10

11

Q. Were you in any way involved in

cover of the few files -- or the files that I did

review, I saw on the first inside of each file

jacket, on some of them, essentially what I would 3

believe to be a settlement agreement. Does that

5 sound familiar to you?

A. Yeah, you would see a settlement

7 agreement. It's got like a pink colored sheet --

Q. Yes.

A. Mm-hmm.

Q. Were you in any way involved in the 10

procurement of the AAIC policy that Mr. McClure 11

purchased, which is the subject of this lawsuit? 12

13 A. No.

14 Q. So McClure bought his own insurance for

his business and you weren't involved in that?

A. Well, he bought coverage for our entire 16 17 operation.

Q. Okay. So does Brimar have any other 18 insurance? 19

20 A. No.

Q. So it's your understanding that Brimar 21

would be covered under Mr. McClure's policy? 22

23 MR. SCOLARO: Objection to the extent my

client is not -- cannot make the legal

1 requesting a copy of the policy?

A. Before or after?

Q. Well, let's do this: When Mr. McClure

enrolled in the AAIC program, were you - you

weren't involved in that process; right? 5

A. No.

Q. Okay. Have you ever made a request to

8 AAIC, you personally, asking for a copy of the

9 policy ---

A. No.

Q. -- at any point?

A. Not personally. I've gone through Brian 12 13 after the fact and said to Brian, "We need a copy

of this policy and we should have had a copy of this policy." 15

16 Q. And when you say "after the fact," you

mean after what? 17 A. After all of the claims had occurred and 18

after all of the cease and desist had occurred and 1.9 20

the issues of AEG and RCA had come on the table. 21 MR. RICE: I don't have any further questions.

22 MR. SCOLARO: I do. I have a few points I

23 want to clarify, but --

MR. RICHARDS: Go ahead. I'm not sure I'm



Toll Free: 800,708,8087 Facsimile: 312,673,8138

7

12

23

24

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

95

96

1 going to have any.

2

4

5

9

15

16

17

18

20

3

15

1.6

17

18

19

20

CROSS EXAMINATION

3 BY MR. SCOLARO:

> Q. Dave, we talked about -- or Dana talked about as far as the AAIC policy, that it was -- and

I believe you testified to the fact that Brian was 6 the one that procured that policy, and when I say 7

8

"Brian", I mean Brian McClure. That's correct?

A. That's right.

10 Q. And as you understand it, any damages that arose pursuant to this matter and pursuant to the AEG insolvency would have been damages as a result of McClure's placement of insurance with 13 that company, being AEG? 14

A. That's right.

Q. And also that those damages were performed by McClure and Associates or their and those agents are licensed brokers and insurance 19 agents; correct?

A. That's right.

2.1 Q. Okay. Now, with respect to those

damages and with respect to payments and claims 22

that were settled on those things, Dana also 23

24 mentioned this was something that Brian had talked

about, there's a McClure and Ciarrachi funnel 1 account is what we've termed it in this deposition? 2

A. That's right.

Q. Now, I want to clarify something. I 4 think Dana referred to it a couple of times as personal funds. But that's -- to that extent,

7 those funds, and it was something I believe you

alluded to, those funds are not personal in the 8

sense that they're Brian McClure and Dave 9

Ciarrachi's personal money; is that correct? In 10 11 other words, and maybe this is a better question,

the McClure and Ciarrachi funnel account consists 12

of funds from B.D. McClure and Associates and

Brimar Administration, Inc.; correct? 14

A. That's right.

Q. And you're not -- because you're not an accountant, you do not -- you're not aware of the specific dynamic of which funds come from -- how much funds are coming from Brimar, how much of the funds are coming from McClure; is that correct?

A. No, I think Barb Gast would be the only 21 person who would know that. I would assume she 22 would know that, she's the keeper -- she's the --23

she does the billing and she does the receivables

1 and so I'm assuming she would know that.

2 Q. Okay. Now, with respect to the

3 reason -- with respect to settling of claims, we

4 talked earlier, and I believe you testified to the 5 fact that, in part, it was a moral obligation you

felt to step in and pay these claims; correct?

A. Yes.

8 But would it also be fair to say that 9 you also felt that ultimately your clients would --10 were threatening to go after you for that money as 11

MR. RICE: Objection: Calls for speculation.

13 BY THE WITNESS:

14 A. I will answer the question this way in 15 due respect to his -- the answer to that question 16 is we were concerned that there would be a 17 value to every claim as time goes on, because in 18 40-plus years in the insurance business, claims 19 don't decrease in value, they increase in value.

20 BY MR. SCOLARO:

Q. And would you say that the Jason Ramirez 21 22 case is indicative of that?

A. Absolutely.

And with respect to the Jason Ramirez

case, Genie had actually tendered that claim to you 1

> for payment; is that not correct? 2 A. They tendered the claim as a first 3

> 4 report of injury. 5

Q. Sure. And then thereafter, once AEG went insolvent, it was also then tendered to B.D.

7 McClure and Associates for payment?

A. After it went -- after -- the case was 8

filed at the Illinois Industrial Commission. There 9

was a hearing heard at the Illinois Industrial 10

11 Commission during the period of the cease and

12 desist. And during that period of time, the

arbitrator made an award. There could be no 13 14 payment made by anybody when the cease and desist

occurred, and for some reason the arbitrator 15

awarded penalties to Mr. Ramirez because there's a 16

time frame when you must honor the payment of any 17

18 award made at the Illinois Industrial Commission.

19 I believe that's a 30-day period. And after

30 days, they have the right to affix penalties. 20

21 When a cease and desist has occurred, we 22 had no option to pay any claim and no action could

23 be taken forth on any claim of the AEG/RCA program.

Yet he saw fit to award penalties. 24



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

5

7

8

9

10

12

14

22

24

4

8

10

11

17

18

24

98

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

1

7

8

17

18

21

2.2

2.4

1

2

4

5 6

8

13

21

April 27, 2010

100

Q. Okay. Understood.

2 And then once those penalties were

3 awarded, is it also accurate to say, then, that

Genie and/or Dale Sippel tendered this -- the award

5 to you requesting that Brian -- that B.D. McClure

and Associates pay that? 6

A. That's right.

Q. Okay. And lastly, Dana had asked a

9 couple questions about how many alternatives were

10 presented to clients of B.D. McClure and Associates

with respect to potential alternatives as far as an 11

alternative to AEG and things like that. Those 12

13 would be questions better suited for -- would it be

accurate to say that those questions would be 1.4

better suited for a producer, such as those 15

employed by B.D. McClure and Associates? 16

A. Well, the fact that I don't have a producer's license doesn't mean that I couldn't

19 answer those questions because, obviously, I'm

20 familiar with production as well as administration.

Q. Sure.

A. So I could quantify an insured as to

what his options are, as could any producer. 23

Q. Okay. But the ones, then, offering

there's some issues now that are developing in that

2 the law firms are threatening not to represent

3 Genie because they haven't made payments of the

4 legal bills which fall into the deductible.

Q. Do you still have copies of the legal

6 bills that you just referred to that you've

tendered to Genie?

A. I'm sure they're in the files.

MR. RICHARDS: Okay. We would ask that they

be produced to our office so we can follow up.

11 MR. SCOLARO: And that's something --

MR. RICHARDS: Something Jeff and I have

spoken about a little bit. 13

MR. SCOLARO: Correct.

15 MR. RICE: I will say for the record that in

my brief review of some of those files. I have seen 16

attorney bills. I can't say that I saw any 17

18 relating to particularly Genie, but I have seen the

19 Scopolias firm letterhead in there on a few of

20 them, so those are things that I know have been

21 kept in some of these files.

MR. SCOLARO: That's something that Paul and I

have also spoken about and continue to speak about 23

even now.

ultimately those policies would be the producer employed by or an agent of B.D. McClure and

Associates? 3

A. That's correct.

MR. SCOLARO: Okay, That's all I wanted. MR. RICHARDS: I have one follow-up and it

7 relates to Genie in particular.

CROSS EXAMINATION

BY MR. RICHARDS: 9

Q. Is Brimar continuing to administer 10 11 claims for Genie that were incurred while AEG was 12 on the risk?

A. Yes.

14 Q. Do you have a ballpark idea,

Mr. Ciarrachi, of how many claims Brimar is 15 continuing to handle?

16 17

A. There's a couple out there that we have 18 with a law firm named Powers & Cronin, and also 19 with Scopolias (phonetic). They're both workers' compensation firms. 20

Q. Okay.

22 A. And we have -- we have this deductible issue, and we have tendered their legal bills to

Genie noting that they are asking for payment. So

THE WITNESS: I think some of them that you've 1

sent checks on and some you have not. That's what

3 I know about --

MR. SCOLARO: I don't know if Paul is --

that's something Paul has to check with and that's

kind of where we are with that, so --

7 BY MR. RICHARDS:

Q. Mr. Ciarrachi, have you had any further 9

contact with Mike Ward since any of this dispute arose?

A. No.

Q. Is Mike Ward continuing in the PEO 12

13 business, do you know?

A. I don't know, but just as a personal 14

aside, I will say that I -- to my amazement, this 15 16

is a man we gave over \$6 million to, and to my

amazement, nothing has happened to Mike Ward.

Q. When you say nothing has happened, he

19 hasn't been indicted or thrown in jail or --20

A. He hasn't been indicted, the IRS hasn't 21 gone after him, the Department of Insurance hasn't

gone after him, the office of the special deputy 22

23 hasn't gone after him, to the best of my knowledge.

Q. Okay. But you don't know whether he



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

DAVID A. CIARRACHI

April 27, 2010

103

104

continues to operate --1

2 A. No.

3

14

16

3

- Q. -- in the PEO industry, do you?
- A. No. I don't.
 - Q. To your knowledge, do either Brimar or
- McClure and Associates place any business presently 6
- 7 with any PEO?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. At the time that you are placing
- 10 insurance with the AEG program, at that point in
- time or prior to that, had you ever been placing 11
- business with a PEO? 12
- 13
 - Q. Did you know back then that AEG was a
- professional employer organization? 15
 - A. At the time we placed business, yes,
- 17 because they have a license -- the State of
- Illinois issues a license for that, and we checked 18
- 19 to make certain that they were licensed by the
- 20
- 21 Q. As a PEO?
- A. That's right. 22
- Q. Okay. Do you have any knowledge as to 23
- 24 whether or not the Illinois Insurance Guaranty Fund

would step in when a PEO goes insolvent, as 1 compared to an insurance company going 2

A. I can't answer that for sure, but it was my understanding that when you have a fronting

- company and then an excess carrier, that it
- fall from the fronting company to the excess
- company to the Guaranty Fund. That would be
- 8 understanding of the stepladder of claims as to
- 9 they would fall.

MR. SCOLARO: And then that was your 10 was that, then, Dave, your understanding with 11 respect to this situation with AEG and RCA? 12

13 THE WITNESS: Yes.

BY MR. RICHARDS: 14

- 15 Q. So, in other words, when AEG is
- insolvent, the risk would go to RCA? 16
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Before it would go to the Illinois
- 19 Insurance Guaranty Fund?
 - A. Yeah, because the way I understood the program is that there was a million dollar
- deductible taken by a syndicate group of people, 22
- 23 the AEG group, so they're responsible for the
- million dollars of the claim. Then there was a

- excess policy written through RCA, and then you
 - 2 always have the -- and I -- I know for a fact that
 - 3 RCA was admitted and licensed in the State of

 - 4 Illinois. If they're admitted and licensed in the
 - State of Illinois, they would pay taxes towards the
 - Guaranty Fund. So it then would be my assumption 7
 - that it would fall to the Guaranty Fund. And this
 - 8 is all assumption, but that's the way I felt the
 - 9 tiers would work.
- 10 Q. In the situation that we have here,
- 11 though, where AEG was declared insolvent but RCA
- was not, would you have an understanding as to what 12
- obligation, if any, the Guaranty Fund would have in
- 14 this situation?
- 15 A. It's my understanding that RCA is
- claiming there wasn't a relationship with AEG, and 16
- 17 to that end, I actually called an attorney in New
- 18 York who Mike Ward gave me, stating that he could
- 19 clarify the issues between AEG and RCA. I talked
- 20 to him three or four different occasions, and he
- told me that there was a discussion -- a dispute
- 22 between the two of them, but he assured me that
- 23 that was going to be resolved and there were no
 - issues. I cannot recall his name right now, but

102

24

3

4

6

7

8

13

17

18

22

- I'm sure I've got that somewhere where I've got the 1
- name of the attorney involved.
- MR. RICHARDS: That's all I have.
 - MR. RICE: I just have two follow-up. Do you
- - MR. SCOLARO: No, that's all I have.
- REDIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. RICE:

- 9 Q. Counsel had asked you about the reasons
- why you decided to pay these claims, and your 10
- response was that to mitigate the damages. Do you 11
- remember that? 12
 - Α. Yes.
- Q. Did anybody or any of the clients that 14
- submitted claims ever threaten to sue you or 15
- Mr. McClure if you didn't make the payment? 16
 - A. I think -- Genie -- Genie through their
 - attorney.
- 19 Q. Okay. Aside from Genie making that 20 representation to you, did any other client do
- 21 that?
 - No, because we paid them all.
- Okay. Aside from the one lawsuit where 23
- 24 Genie just filed, have you or Mr. McClure or Brimar



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138

DAVID	Δ	CIARRACHI

DAV	D A. CIARRACHI		April 27, 2010
	105		107
1	or McClure and Associates ever been named as a	1	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I do hereunto set my
2	defendant involved in a case like this?	2	hand and affix my seal of office at Woodridge,
3	A. No.	3	Illinois, this 23rd day of August, A.D. 2010.
4	MR. RICE: Okay. I have no further questions.	4	
5	MR. SCOLARO: I don't either.	5	
6	MR. RICE: Do you want to waive signature,	6	
7	reserve it?	7	
8	MR. SCOLARO: Dave, to explain, you have the	8	Notary Public, DuPage County, Illinois.
9	opportunity to review the transcript for any errors	9	, <u>, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , </u>
10	or things that you would like to clarify well,	10	
11	not clarify, any errors in the transcript. It	11	ALICE M. SCHWINGER, CSR No. 84-2913
12	wouldn't be an opportunity to change anything	12	7. E. S. E.
13	you've said but to correct any potential transcript	13	
14	errors. It's our recommendation typically to waive	14	
	**	15	
15 16	signature.	16	
	THE WITNESS: Then we'll waive it.	17	
17	MR. SCOLARO: Okay.	18	
18	FURTHER DEPONENT SAITH NOT.	19	
19		20	
20		21	
21			
22		22	
23		23 24	
24		24	
1	STATE OF ILLINOIS	7	
1	STATE OF ILLINOIS)	1	EXAMINATION
2) SS:	2	Page Line
3	COUNTY OF DUPAGE)	3	WITNESS NAME
4	I, ALICE M. SCHWINGER, CSR No. 84-2913,	4	DAVID A. CIARRACHI
5	a Notary Public within and for the County of	5	Direct Examination By Mr. 3 6
6 7	DuPage, State of Illinois, and a Certified	6	Rice:
	Shorthand Reporter of said state, do hereby	7	Cross Examination By Mr. 93
8	certify:	8	Scolaro:
	That previous to the commencement of the examination of the witness, the witness was duly	9	Cross Examination By Mr. 98
10 11	sworn to testify the whole truth concerning the	10 11	Richards:
12	matters herein;	12	Redirect Examination by Mr. 104
13	That the foregoing deposition transcript	13	Rice:
14	was reported stenographically by me, was thereafter	14	EVUIDITO
15	reduced to typewriting under my personal direction	15	EXHIBITS Page Line
16	and constitutes a true record of the testimony	16	Deposition Exhibit Page Line
17	given and the proceedings had;	17	No. 1
18	That the said deposition was taken	18	No. 2 56 4
19	before me at the time and place specified;	19	No. 3 71 15
20	That I am not a relative or employee or	20	No. 4 86 19
21	attorney or counsel, nor a relative or employee of	21	
22	such attorney or counsel for any of the parties		
44		22	
	harata nor interacted directly or indirectly in	2.2	
23	hereto, nor interested directly or indirectly in the outcome of this action.	23 24	



Toll Free: 800.708.8087 Facsimile: 312.673.8138